Int. J. Nonlinear Anal. Appl. 12 (2021) No. 1, 397-403 ISSN: 2008-6822 (electronic) http://dx.doi.org/10.22075/ijnaa.2021.4812



# On J-class $C_0$ -semigroups of operators

Abolfazl Nezhadali Baghan<sup>a</sup>, Mohammad Janfada<sup>b,\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Department of Pure Mathematics, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, International Campus, Mashhad, Iran. <sup>b</sup>Department of Pure Mathematics, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, P. O. Box 1159, Mashhad 91775, Iran

(Communicated by Madjid Eshaghi Gordji)

### Abstract

In this paper, locally topologically transitive (or J-class)  $C_0$ -semigroups of operators on Banach spaces are studied. Some similarity and differences of locally transitivity and hypercyclicity of  $C_0$ semigroups are investigated. Next the Kato's limit of a sequence of  $C_0$ -semigroups are considered and their locally transitivity relations are studied.

*Keywords:* Hypercyclic  $C_0$ -semigroup; J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup; approximation in the sense of Kato. 2010 MSC: Primary 47D03 ; Secondary 47A16, 47A58.

## 1. Introduction and preliminaries

A continuous linear operator T on a Banach space X is called hypercyclic if it has a hypercyclic vector  $x \in X$ , i.e. there is a vector  $x \in X$  such that  $orb(T, x) := \{T^n x : n \in \mathbb{N}_0\}$  is dense in X. In [13], Kitai, and in [9] Gethner and Shapiro gave independently a sufficient condition for hypercyclicity which is useful in applications. Using Baire's category theorem, it can be shown that a bounded linear operator T on a separable Banach space is hypercyclic if and only if it is topologically transitive, i.e. for every two open, non-empty subsets U, V of X there is a natural number n such that  $U \cap T^n(V) \neq \emptyset$ .

An operator  $T \in B(X)$ , the space of all bounded linear operators on X, is called a J-class operator, if there exists  $0 \neq x \in X$  such that  $J_T(x) = X$ , where

 $J_T(x) := \{ y \in X : \text{ there exists a strictly increasing sequence} \\ \text{ of natural numbers } (k_n)_n \text{ and a sequence} \\ (x_n)_n \text{ in } X \text{ such that } x_n \to x \text{ and } T^{k_n}(x_n) \to y \}.$ 

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author

*Email addresses:* nejadali.2000@yahoo.com (Abolfazl Nezhadali Baghan), janfada@um.ac.ir (Mohammad Janfada)

The vector x is said to be a J-class vector. It is clear that topologically transitive operators are J-class.

Many facts about hypercyclic and J-class operators are investigated by G. Costakis and A. Manoussos in [4] and [3]. For more properties of J-class operators, one can see [14, 15] and [19].

In the continuous case, a one-parameter family  $T = \{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  of continuous linear operators on X, is a strongly continuous semigroup (or  $C_0$ -semigroup) of operators, if T(0) = I, T(t)T(s) = T(t+s), for all  $t, s \geq 0$ , and  $\lim_{t\to 0} T(t)x = x$  for all  $x \in X$ . The operator  $A : D(A) \subseteq X \to X$  defined by  $Ax = \lim_{t\to 0} \frac{T(t)x-x}{t}$  is called the generator of the  $C_0$ -semigroups T, where  $D(A) = \{x \in X :$  $\lim_{t\to 0} \frac{T(t)x-x}{t}$  exists  $\}$ . For further information about  $C_0$ -semigroups we refer the reader to the books [8, 16].

A  $C_0$ -semigroup  $T = \{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is said to be hypercyclic if  $orb(T, x) := \{T(t)x : t \geq 0\}$  is dense in X for some  $x \in X$ . Desch, Schappacher and Webb in [6] initiated the investigation of hypercyclic semigroups. So far, several specific examples of hypercyclic strongly continuous semigroups have been studied, see for example [1, 2, 6, 7, 10, 11, 17]. As in the single operator case, the first example of a hypercyclic  $C_0$ -semigroup was given by Rolewicz [18], in 1969. J-class  $C_0$ -semigroups of operators, also called topologically transitive  $C_0$ -semigroups, where else studied by Nasseri in [14].

**Definition 1.1.** A  $C_0$ -semigroup  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  on a normed space X is called J-class if there exists  $0 \neq x \in X$  such that  $J_T(x) = X$ , where

$$J_T(x) := \{ y \in X : \text{ there exist a strictly increasing sequence} \\ (t_n)_n \subseteq [0, \infty) \text{ with } t_n \to \infty \text{ and a sequence} \\ (x_n)_n \text{ in } X \text{ such that } x_n \to x \text{ and } T(t_n)(x_n) \to y \}.$$

Trivially if there exists  $t_0 \ge 0$  such that  $T(t_0)$  is J-class, then  $\{T(t)\}_{t\ge 0}$  is also a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup. Put

$$A_T := \{ x \in X : J_T(x) = X \}$$

By Theorem 4.1.9 [14],  $A_T$  and  $J_T(x)$  are closed subsets of X. Using proof similar to the proof of Proposition 4.1.8 of [14], one can see that

 $J_T(x) = \{ y \in X : \text{for every neighborhood } U \text{ of } x \text{ and neighborhood } V \text{ of } y \text{ there exists } t > 0 \text{ such that } T(t)U \cap V \neq \emptyset \}.$ 

**Remark 1.2.** i) For a  $C_0$ -semigroup  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$ , if  $||T(t)|| \leq 1$  for all  $t \geq 0$ , i.e. T is contraction  $C_0$ -semigroup, then T is not J-class. Indeed if in this case, there exists  $x \in X$  such that  $J_T(x) = X$ , then with M = ||x|| + 1 and any  $y \in X$ , there exist a sequence  $(x_n) \subseteq X$  and and a sequence  $(t_k) \subseteq \mathbb{R}$  such that  $x_k \to x$  and  $T(t_k)x_k \to y$ . For large enough k we know

$$||x_k|| \le ||x_k - x|| + ||x|| < 1 + ||x|| = M.$$

Thus  $||T(t_k)x_k|| \le ||x_k|| \le M$ , which implies that  $||y|| \le M$  and this is a contradiction. ii) If X is a finite dimensional Banach space then one can prove that there is no J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup

on X. Indeed this follows from the fact that  $C_0$ -semigroups on finite dimensional spaces are of the form exp(tA) with A bounded. If the  $C_0$ -semigroup exp(tA) is J-class, then the spectrum  $\sigma(A)$  of A has to intersect the unit circle. But in finite dimensional case  $\sigma(A) = \sigma_p(A)$ , where  $\sigma_p(A)$  is the point spectrum of A. This implies that  $\sigma_p(A^*)$  intersect the unite circle. This together with [14] Proposition 4.1.12 turn to a contradiction (This part is contributed by A. B. Nasseri). In this paper, we study properties of J-class  $C_0$ -semigroups. In Section 2, some elementary properties of J-class  $C_0$ -semigroups are studied. In particular, by some examples, it is proved that many properties of hypercyclic  $C_0$ -semigroups are not valid for locally topologically transitive  $C_0$ -semigroups. In Section 3, the Kato's limit of  $C_0$ -semigroups and their locally topologically transitivity properties are studied.

#### 2. J-class $C_0$ -semigroups of operators

The following characterization of J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup will be useful in the rest of the paper.

**Theorem 2.1.** For a  $C_0$ -semigroup  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  on a Banach space X, the following assertions are equivalent:

- i)  $\{T(t)\}_{t>0}$  is J-class;
- ii) There exists a non-zero  $x \in X$  such that for every  $y \in X$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exist  $u \in X$  and t > 0 with  $||u x|| < \varepsilon$  and  $||T(t)u y|| < \varepsilon$ .

**Proof**. Let  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be J-class. So there exists  $0 \neq x \in X$  such that  $J_T(x) = X$ . For given  $y \in X$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$ , letting  $V = N_{\varepsilon}(y)$  and  $U = N_{\varepsilon}(x)$   $(N_{\varepsilon}(y))$  is the neighborhood of y with reduce  $\varepsilon$ ), we may find t > 0 such that

$$T(t)U \cap V \neq \emptyset$$

So there exists  $u \in U$  such that  $||T(t)u - y|| < \varepsilon$  and  $||u - x|| < \varepsilon$ . Conversely, suppose that (ii) holds for some  $x \in X$ . We shall show that  $J_T(x) = X$ .

Let  $y \in X$  and U be an arbitrary neighborhood of x. There exists  $\varepsilon_0$  such that  $N_{\varepsilon_0}(x) \subseteq U$ . For every neighborhood V of y there exists  $\varepsilon_1$  such that  $N_{\varepsilon_1}(y) \subseteq V$ . Put  $\varepsilon = \min\{\varepsilon_0, \varepsilon_1\}$ . By (ii) there exists  $u \in N_{\varepsilon}(x) \subseteq U$  and t > 0 such that  $T(t)u \in N_{\varepsilon}(y) \subseteq V$ , which implies that  $T(t)U \cap V \neq \emptyset$ .  $\Box$ 

**Theorem 2.2.** Let  $T = \{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  and  $S = \{S(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be two  $C_0$ -semigroups on Banach spaces X and Y, respectively and  $\phi: X \to Y$  be a continuous function with dense range such that  $\phi(A_T \setminus \{0\}) \neq \{0\}$  and  $S(t) \circ \phi = \phi \circ T(t)$ , for all  $t \geq 0$ . If T is J-class, then so is S.

**Proof**. If T is J-class, then by the fact that  $\phi(A_T) \neq \{0\}$  we may choose  $0 \neq x \in X$  such that  $J_T(x) = X$  and  $\phi(x) \neq 0$ . We claim that  $J_S(\phi(x)) = Y$ .

Let  $z \in ran \phi$ , then there exists  $y \in X = J_T(x)$  such that  $\phi(y) = z$ .

So there exists  $(x_n) \subseteq X$  and a strictly increasing sequence of positive real numbers  $(t_n)_n$  such that  $t_n \to \infty$ ,  $x_n \to x$  and  $T(t_n)x_n \to y$ . By continuity of  $\phi$ ,  $y_n := \phi(x_n) \to \phi(x)$  and  $S(t_n) \circ \phi(x_n) = \phi(T(t_n)x_n) \to \phi(y) = z$ .

Thus  $J_S(\phi(x)) \supseteq ran \phi$ . But  $J_S(\phi(x))$  is closed and  $ran \phi$  is dense so  $J_S(\phi(x)) = Y$ .  $\Box$  The following example shows that the hypothesis  $\phi(A_T) \neq \{0\}$  cannot be removed. Also it shows that if the direct sum of two  $C_0$ -semigroups is J-class then its is not necessary that these  $C_0$ -semigroups are J-class.

**Example 2.3.** Let X, Y be two complex Banach spaces, where X is separable. Let  $A \in B(Y)$ with  $\sigma(A) \subset \{z \in \mathbb{C} : Rez > 0\}$ . If  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is a hypercyclic  $C_0$ -semigroup on X, then the system  $B(t) := e^{tA} \oplus T(t)$  is a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup on the Banach space  $X \oplus Y$  and  $A_B = \{0\} \oplus X$  (Theorem 4.1.13, [14]). Now consider  $\phi : X \oplus Y \to Y$  defined by  $\phi(x \oplus y) = y$ . Then with  $S(t) := e^{tA}$  we have  $\phi \circ B(t) = S(t) \circ \phi$ , B(t) is J-class but S(t) is not J-class, since  $\sigma(A) \cap i\mathbb{R} = \emptyset$  (see Lemma 4.1.14, [14]). Indeed in this case  $\phi(A_B) = \{0\}$ . This example also shows that if  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup on a Banach space X and  $M_1$ ,  $M_2$  are two non-trivial invariant closed subspaces of X, where  $X = M_1 \oplus M_2$ , then  $\{T(t)|_{M_i}\}_{t\geq 0}$  is not J-class on  $M_i$ , i = 1, 2, in general.

The following proposition shows that locally topologically transitivity of the direct sum of a  $C_0$ -semigroup with itself, implies that it is also locally topologically transitive.

**Proposition 2.4.** Let  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be a  $C_0$ -semigroup on a Banach space X. If  $\{T(t) \oplus T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is locally topologically transitive  $C_0$ -semigroup on  $X \oplus X$ , then so is  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$ .

**Proof**. Let  $J_{T\oplus T}(x \oplus y) = X \oplus X$ , for some non-zero  $x \oplus y \in X \oplus X$ . Without loss of generality let  $x \neq 0$ . Thus for every  $z \in X$ , there exist a sequence  $(x_n \oplus y_n)_n \in X \oplus X$  and a strictly increasing sequence  $(t_n) \in [0, \infty)$  with  $t_n \to \infty$  such that  $x_n \oplus y_n \to x \oplus y$  and  $T(t_n) \oplus T(t_n)(x_n \oplus y_n) \to z \oplus z$ . These imply that  $x_n \to x$  and  $T(t_n)x_n \to z$ , i.e.  $J_T(x) = X$ .  $\Box$ 

As a consequence of this proposition one can see that if X is a real-Banach space, X is the complexification of X,  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is a  $C_0$ -semigroup on X and  $\{\widetilde{T}(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is the complexification of  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$ , then locally topologically transitivity of  $\{\widetilde{T}(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  implies that  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is locally topologically transitive.

In the following proposition, we show that the direct sum of two J-class  $C_0$ -semigroups is not J-class in general. Note that the adjoint of a  $C_0$ -semigroup on a Hilbert space is again a  $C_0$ -semigroup.

**Proposition 2.5.** Let  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup on a Hilbert space H such that  $\{T^*(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is also J-class. Then  $T(t) \oplus T^*(t)$  is not a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup.

**Proof**. Assume that  $T(t) \oplus T^*(t)$  is a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup. So there exist  $x, y \in H$  such that  $J_{T \oplus T^*}(x \oplus y) = H \oplus H$  and  $x \oplus y \neq 0$ .

Case I: Suppose that one of the vectors x, y is zero. Without loss of generality assume x = 0. Then there exist a strictly increasing sequence  $(t_n)_n \subseteq [0, \infty)$  with  $t_n \to \infty$  and sequences  $(x_n)_n, (y_n)_n \in H$ such that  $x_n \to x = 0, y_n \to y, T(t_n)x_n \to y$  and  $T^*(t_n)y_n \to x = 0$ . Taking limits in the following equality  $\langle T(t_n)x_n, y_n \rangle = \langle x_n, T^*(t_n)y_n \rangle$  we get that ||x|| = ||y|| = 0 and hence y = 0. Therefore  $x \oplus y = 0$ , which yields a contradiction.

Case II: Suppose that  $x \neq 0$  and  $y \neq 0$ . Let us show first that  $J_{T \oplus T^*}(\lambda x \oplus \mu y) = H \oplus H$ , for every  $\lambda, \mu \in \mathbb{C} \setminus \{0\}$ . Indeed, fix  $\lambda, \mu \in \mathbb{C} \setminus \{0\}$ . Take any  $z, w \in H$ . Since  $J_{T \oplus T^*}(x \oplus y) = H \oplus H$ , there exist a strictly increasing sequence  $(t_n)_n \subseteq [0, \infty)$  with  $t_n \to \infty$  and sequences  $(x_n)_n, (y_n)_n \in H$  such that  $x_n \to x, y_n \to y, T(t_n)x_n \to \lambda^{-1}z$  and  $T^*(t_n)y_n \to \mu^{-1}w$ . This implies that  $z \oplus w \in J_{T \oplus T^*}(\lambda x \oplus \mu y)$ , hence  $J_{T \oplus T^*}(\lambda x \oplus \mu y) = H \oplus H$ . With no loss of generality we may assume that  $||x|| \neq ||y||$  (because if ||x|| = ||y||, by multiplying with a suitable  $\lambda \in \mathbb{C} \setminus \{0\}$  we have  $\lambda ||x|| \neq ||y||$  and  $J_{T \oplus T^*}(\lambda x \oplus y) = H \oplus H$ ). Taking limits in the following equality  $\langle T(t_n)x_n, y_n \rangle = \langle x_n, T^*(t_n)y_n \rangle$  we get that ||x|| = ||y||, which is a contradiction.  $\Box$ 

**Proposition 2.6.** Suppose X is a normed space,  $C_0$ -semigroup  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is J-class on X, and Y is a Banach space containing X as a dense subspace. Then the extension of T in Y is J-class.

**Proof**. Let for  $0 \neq x \in X$ ,  $J_T(x) = X$ . For every  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $y \in Y = \overline{X}$  there exists  $y_1 \in X$  such that  $\|y_1 - y\| < \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$ . For  $y_1 \in X$  there exist  $u \in X$  and  $t_1 > 0$  such that  $\|u - x\| < \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$ ,  $\|y_1 - T(t)u\| < \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$ . So

$$||y - T(t)u|| \le ||y - y_1|| + ||y_1 - T(t)v|| < \frac{\varepsilon}{2} + \frac{\varepsilon}{2} = \varepsilon.$$

#### 3. Limit of $C_0$ -semigroups in the sense of Kato

A sequence  $\{(X_n, \|\cdot\|_n) : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  of Banach spaces is said to be convergent to a Banach space  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  in the sense of Kato (see [12], Chap. IX, Sect. 4) and is denoted by  $X_n \xrightarrow{K} X$ , if for any n there is a linear operator  $P_n \in B(X, X_n)$  (called an approximating operator) satisfying the following two conditions:

- $(K_1) \lim_{n \to \infty} ||P_n f||_n = ||f||$  for any  $f \in X$ ;
- $(K_2)$  for any  $f_n \in X_n$ , there exists  $f^{(n)} \in X$  such that  $f_n = P_n f^{(n)}$  with  $||f^{(n)}|| \leq C ||f_n||_n$  (C is independent of n).

Let  $X_n \xrightarrow{K} X$  and  $B_n \in B(X_n)$ . The sequence  $(B_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is said to be convergent to B in the sense of Kato if  $\lim_{n\to\infty} \|B_n P_n f - P_n Bf\|_n = 0$ , for any  $f \in X$ . In this case we write  $B_n \xrightarrow{K} B$ .

**Theorem 3.1.** Let  $\{(X_n, \|\cdot\|_n) : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a sequence of Banach spaces convergeing to a Banach space  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  in the sense of Kato. Suppose that  $T = \{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is a J-class  $C_0$ -semigroup on X for which  $P_n(A_T) \neq \{0\}$  and  $\{T_n(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is a  $C_0$ -semigroup on  $(X_n, \|\cdot\|_n)$ . If for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  one has

$$P_n T(t) f = T_n(t) P_n f, \quad (f \in X, \ t \ge 0),$$
(3.1)

then  $\{T_n(t)\}_{t>0}$  is also J-class.

**Proof**. Let  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be J-class. So there exists a non-zero  $f^* \in X$  such that  $J_T(f^*) = X$ . By our hypothesis, we may choose  $f^*$  such that  $P_n f^* \neq 0$ . We shall prove that  $J_{T_n}(P_n f^*) = X_n$ . For any  $g_n \in X_n$  from  $(K_2)$ , there exists  $g^{(n)} \in X$  such that  $g_n = P_n g^{(n)}$  and  $||g^{(n)}|| \leq C||g_n||_n$ . For arbitrary  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exist  $u \in X$  and t > 0 such that  $||u - f^*|| < \varepsilon$  and  $||g^{(n)} - T(t)u|| < \varepsilon$ . Put  $f_n^* := P_n f^*$ ,  $u_n := P_n u$  and  $t_n := t$ . The assumption  $(K_1)$  implies the uniform boundedness of  $\{P_n\}$ . Therefore

$$||u_n - f_n^*||_n = ||P_n u - P_n f^*||_n \le ||P_n|| ||u - f^*|| \le ||P_n||\varepsilon$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \|g_n - T_n(t_n)u_n\| &= \|P_n g^{(n)} - T_n(t)P_n u\|_n \\ &= \|P_n g^{(n)} - P_n T(t)u\|_n \\ &\leq \|P_n\| \|g^{(n)} - T(t)u\| \leq \|P_n\|\varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

 $\Box$  For any constant C and  $f_n \in X_n$ , define

$$l_C(f_n) := \{ f^{(n)} \in X : P_n f^{(n)} = f_n \text{ with } \| f^{(n)} \| \le C \| f_n \| \}.$$

**Theorem 3.2.** Suppose that (3.1) holds for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\{T_n(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is J-class. If there exists a constant C such that for every  $f \in X$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is an  $f^{(n)} \in l_C(P_n f)$  with  $||f - f^{(n)}|| < \varepsilon$ , then  $\{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  is also J-class.

**Proof**. Let  $\{T_n(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be J-class on  $X_n$ . So there exists a non-zero  $f_n^* \in X_n$  such that  $J_{T_n}(f_n^*) = X_n$ . From  $(K_2)$ , there exists  $f_*^{(n)} \in X$  such that  $f_n^* = P_n f_*^{(n)}$ . By the linearity of  $P_n$ ,  $f_*^{(n)} \neq 0$ . We shall show that  $J_T(f_*^{(n)}) = X$ . Let  $g \in X$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$  be given. Put  $g_n := P_n g$ . So there exist t > 0 and  $u_n^* \in X_n$  such that  $||u_n^* - f_n^*|| < \varepsilon$  and  $||g_n - T_n(t)u_n^*||_n < \varepsilon$ . From  $(K_2)$ , there exists  $u_*^{(n)} \in X$  such that  $u_n^* = P_n u_*^{(n)}$ . Now for  $h = g - T(t)u_*^{(n)}$ , there exists  $h^{(n)} \in P_n h$ , with  $||h - h^{(n)}|| < \varepsilon$  and

$$P_n h^{(n)} = P_n h = g_n - P_n T(t) u_*^{(n)}$$

As a consequence of (3.1), we obtain that

$$g_n - P_n T(t) u_*^{(n)} = g_n - T_n(t) P_n u_*^{(n)}.$$

So

$$\begin{aligned} |g - T(t)u_*^{(n)}|| &\leq ||h - h^{(n)}|| + ||h^{(n)}|| \\ &\leq \varepsilon + C||g_n - T_n(t)P_nu_*^{(n)}||_n \\ &\leq (1 + C)\varepsilon \end{aligned}$$

and

$$||u_*^{(n)} - f_*^{(n)}|| \le C ||P_n u_*^{(n)} - P_n f_*^{(n)}||_n \le C ||P_n||\varepsilon$$

**Remark 3.3.** Let  $T_n = \{T_n(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  and  $T = \{T(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  be  $C_0$ -semigroups on the Banach spaces  $(X_n, \|\cdot\|)$  and  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$ , respectively,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . The sequence  $(T_n)$  is said to be convergent to T in the sense of Kato if for any  $\tau > 0$ ,

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \sup_{t \in [0,\tau]} \|T_n(t)P_n(f) - P_nT(t)f\|_n = 0, \quad (f \in X).$$

If  $T_n$  is J-class then it is not true that T is also J-class, in general. For showing this, we apply Theorem 3.3 of [5]. Let  $X_n = X := l^1$ , B is the backward shift on  $l^1$  and  $A = \alpha(B - I)$ , for some  $\alpha > 0$ . If  $T = \{T(t)\}_{t \ge 0}$  is the C<sub>0</sub>-semigroup generated by A then

$$||T(t)|| = ||e^{\alpha t(B-I)}|| = e^{-\alpha t} ||e^{t\alpha B}|| \le e^{-\alpha t} e^{||t\alpha B||} = 1.$$

This, by Remark 1.2, implies that T is not J-class. Now, by [5] Theorem 3.3, the  $C_0$ -semigroup  $\{T_n(t)\}_{t\geq 0}$  generated by  $A_n := -\alpha I + \beta_n B$  is hypercyclic and so is J-class, where  $\beta_n > \alpha > 0$  and  $\beta_n \to \alpha$ . Also the sequence  $(T_n)_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  converges to T, in the sense of Kato (see [5] Theorem 3.3).

#### References

- T. Bermúdez, A. Bonilla and A. Martinón, On the existence of chaotic and hypercyclic semigroups on Banach spaces, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 131(8) (2003) 2435–2441.
- T. Bermúrdez, A. Bonilla, J. A. Conejero and A. Peris, Hypercyclic, topologically mixing and chaotic semigroups on Banach spaces, Studia Math. 170(1) (2005) 57–75.
- [3] G. Costakis and A. Manoussos, J-class weighted shifts on the space of bounded sequences of complex numbers, Integral Equ. Oper. Theory 62 (2008) 149–158.
- [4] G. Costakis and A. Manoussos, J-class operators and hypercyclicity, J. Operator Theory, 67 (2012) 101–119.
- [5] R. DeLaubenfels, H. Emamirad and V. Protopopescu, *Linear chaos and approximation*, J. Approx. Theory 105(1) (2000) 176–187.
- [6] W. Desch, W. Schappacher and G.F. Webb, Hypercyclic and chaotic semigroups of linear operators, Ergodic Theory Dynam. Syst. 17 (1997) 793–819.

- [7] H. Emamirad, Hypercyclicity in the scattering theory for linear transport equation, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 350 (1998) 3707–3716.
- [8] K.J. Engel and R. Nagel, One-Parameter Semigroups for Linear Evolution Equations, Springer-Verlag, New York, 2000.
- R. Gethner and J.H. Shapiro, Universal vectors for operators on spaces of holomorphic functions, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 100(2) (1987) 281–288.
- [10] T. Kalmes, On chaotic  $C_0$ -semigroups and infinitely regular hypercyclic vectors, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 134 (2006) 2997–3002.
- [11] T. Kalmes, Hypercyclic, Mixing, and Chaotic C<sub>0</sub>-Semigroups, Ph. D. Thesis, Trier University, 2006.
- [12] T. Kato, Perturbation Theory for Linear Operators, Springer-Verlag, Berlin-New York, 1966.
- [13] C. Kitai, *Invariant closed sets for linear operators*, Ph. D. Thesis, University of Tornto, 1982.
- [14] A.B. Nasseri, J-class Operators on Certain Banach Spaces, Ph. D. Thesis, Dortmund University, 2013.
- [15] A.B. Nasseri, On the existence of J-class operators on Banach spaces, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 140 (2012) 3549– 3555.
- [16] A. Pazy, Semigroups of Linear Operators and Applications to Partial Differential Equations, Springer-Verlag, New York, 1992.
- [17] V. Protopopescu and Y. Azmy, Topological chaos for a class of linear models, Math. Models Methods Appl. Sci. 2 (1992) 79–90.
- [18] S. Rolewicz, On orbits of elements, Studia Math. 32(1969) 17–22.
- [19] G. Tian and B. Hou, *Limits of J-class operators*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 142(5)(2014) 1663–1667.