

Investigating economic factors affecting ethnicity in Azerbaijan, Iran

Erfan Imani Darestani

Department of Economics and Political Science, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran

(Communicated by Majid Eshaghi Gordji)

Abstract

Ethnicism among ethnic groups is one of the factors that endangers national cohesion and unity. Considering the events and incidents of the last few years in the Azerbaijan region and the historical precedent of the issue of Pan-Turkism, the issue of ethnicity in this region is considered a serious concern for the Islamic Republic of Iran, which has also received the attention of researchers. However, the impact of economic factors on the intensification or reduction of ethnicism in Iran's Azerbaijan has been neglected in research. Therefore, in this research, an attempt was made to investigate this issue by using the analytical-descriptive method and collecting data with a questionnaire from a sample of 292 Turkish language students and by referring to correlation and regression analyses. The results of this study showed that all the considered assumptions have been confirmed and that political ethnicity in Azerbaijan has a statistically significant and direct relationship with the improvement of national economic indicators, the improvement of economic indicators of Turkish-speaking countries and an inverse relationship with the increase of interactions with It has other Turkic speaking countries and other regions of Iran.

Keywords: ethnicism, economic interactions, Azerbaijan, economic ties, pan-Turkism
2020 MSC: 37N40, 62P20, 91B76

1 Introduction

The issue of identity and ethnic challenges is always considered one of the basic concerns of politicians in security fields, and in addition, one of the important reasons for the development or non-development of countries. Solving this challenge can lead to the preparation of the platform for the growth and development of a country or making this path smoother, and at the same time, not solving this concern can cause serious damage to the security, development process and intentions of a country.

Studies show that the passage of time has proven the opposite of Marx's opinion, and today there are no signs of the weakening and destruction of ethnicity anywhere in the world, and on the contrary, its importance has also increased [19]. This issue is seen not only in the third world but also in the developed world. After the Cold War, the most important cause of war and violence in the world has been ethnic and cultural conflicts [14].

Meanwhile, Iran is among the ten countries with the most variety of dialects and languages in the world, and the Turkic-speaking Azeris are the second largest Iranian ethnic group with a population of over twenty million people. During recent decades; After the Second World War until today, the region of Azerbaijan has been struggling with the

Email address: erphanimani@gmail.com (Erfan Imani Darestani)

problem of ethnicism and pan-Turkism, and on the one hand, it has become a toy of the great regional and sometimes global powers from the Iranian government, and on the other hand, it has become a threat to the territorial integrity of Iran.

Pan-Turkism movement was first formed in tsarist Russia and it was propagated by figures like Gasperinsky and Yusuf Akhchora. They tried to resist the pressure of Russian Pan-Slavism by emphasizing the Turkish language and culture. Pan-Turkism was the reason for the unification of the Turks inside the Russian Empire. Later, the Russians realized that Pan-Turkism would increase the ethnic consciousness of Turks, as a result, they closed down Pan-Turk political and literary centers and associations and exiled its influential figures to the Ottoman Empire [3].

With the end of the First World War and the defeat of the government of unity and progress in Turkey, the tendency towards Pan-Turkism subsided and the activity of this group took on a more cultural aspect. Therefore, by changing the Arabic script to Latin and removing Persian and Arabic words from the Turkish language, this trend tried to create a common language for all Turks.

Berdard [11]. After that, the Soviet Union became the flag bearer of Pan-Turkic policies and led it for a long time. With the establishment of the Qajar rule in Iran and the appearance of the country's military weakness, some of the regional governments encouraged the Iranian peoples to seek independence to achieve their developmental goals and sometimes created severe tensions and disagreements.

Considering the events and incidents of recent years in the Azerbaijan region and the historical precedent of the Pan-Turkism issue, the issue of ethnicity in this region is considered a serious concern for the Islamic Republic of Iran, which has also received the attention of researchers. However, the impact of economic factors on the intensification or reduction of ethnicism in Iran's Azerbaijan has been neglected in the research, and the upcoming research tries to answer the basic question of what effect various internal economic factors have had on ethnicity in Iran's Azerbaijan? In addition, other sub-questions under the titles of whether the economic conditions of neighboring Turkic-speaking countries have an effect on political ethnicism in Azerbaijan? Will more economic ties between Azeri-inhabited regions with other Turkic-speaking countries and other regions of Iran have an effect on the level of political ethnocentrism in Azerbaijan? It is also suggested that by examining a number of economic indicators taken from the country's statistical yearbooks, budget laws and the results of the housing population censuses, with an emphasis on the years 1978-2020, a more detailed understanding of the subject is reached and suitable answers to the questions are proposed.

2 Theoretical foundations and research background

2.1 Ethnicism

Giddens [7] does not think of ethnicity and ethnic differences as neutral and pointless things and believes that this concept unconsciously includes the meaning of "self" and "other" and with issues such as inequality in the distribution of power or wealth between the two. The handle is tied [7].

Haywood [8] considers ethnocentrism as a tool to achieve political freedom and get rid of structural deprivations and inequalities that have become the norm. By explaining the center-periphery model and its global and transnational as well as transnational dimension, he considers systematic inequalities and "domestic colonization" as necessary and insufficient factors for the formation of ethnocentrism. With a historical explanation, he states that ethnocentrism or "ethnic consciousness" in his exact expression, like nationalism, is a phenomenon specific to industrialized and modern societies and has a continuous relationship with the concept of colonialism [8].

Ethnocentrism means giving superiority to one ethnic group over other ethnic groups. In other words, ethnicism [or ethnicism] means that a person considers his ethnic group to be superior to other ethnic groups in a certain characteristic, or considers himself to have a special privilege because he belongs to a certain ethnic group. This view can be viewed from two dimensions of historical nature or political and social purposes. Ethnocentrism in the political dimension follows the effort or struggle with the national government to protect the interests and identity of an ethnic group [17].

2.2 Ethnicism in Azerbaijan, Iran

In principle, the reasons for ethnicism and other expressions of the politicization of language and religious issues in Iran cannot be accurately investigated without considering international politics and the foreign policy of great powers, because ethnicism in Iranian peoples should be considered as a product of the competitive policies of great powers and especially as a product of the bipolar order of the Cold War. This phenomenon in "Azerbaijan" in the middle of the 19th century should be considered as the result of the policies of the Russian tsar, then the Soviet

Union and the Ottoman Empire, as well as strategic policies such as receiving oil concessions and annexation. On the other hand, this issue is the result of the discursive influence of the two liberal and non-religious ideas of European nationalism and Marxism-Leninism based on self-governance on Azeri elites [1].

The movements that arose before Reza Shah's reign in Azerbaijan cannot be considered ethnic or separatist in nature. But the emergence of the democratic sect of Azerbaijan in this region can be considered an ethnic movement in line with political demands [17].

After the Islamic Revolution of 1957, the Muslim People's Republic Party announced its existence one week after the Islamic Republic Party. Although this party was under the spiritual leadership of Ayatollah Shariatmadari, although it had national and patriotic tendencies, it was made up of elites and educated people of Azerbaijan and had ethnic political demands. For example, the party demanded the right of self-governance for all nationalities in the form of Iran and proposed the formation of state assemblies. The proposers believed that the plan to form provincial councils and the People's Assembly of Iran prevented the concentration of power in the central government and the centrality of the country. At the same time, it would weaken the decision-making power of the provincial centers and injustice to the smaller cities. For this reason, establishing such an institution will help establish real equality and justice among the people of Iran. In recent years, especially after the Tabriz Tractorsazi team made its way to the Premier League on June 18, 2008, a lot of identity, ethnic, sometimes racist and separatist slogans have been heard from the platforms of Yadgar Imam Stadium in Tabriz. It can be clearly claimed that Tractor team games, especially at home, have become a safe haven for separatist and Pan-Trek groups, and without special strictness by the security apparatus, the most dangerous slogans and movements against territorial integrity and national unity are chanted and carried out by some attendees on the platforms.

In the 10th term of the Islamic Council and on November 9, 2016, a faction named "Turk-inhabited regions faction" was established in a surprising and unprecedented action. The goal of this faction was to follow up and solve the livelihood, economic and educational problems of the Turkic areas by solving the legal loopholes and regulatory problems and creating "balanced development" in the country [18].

2.3 Economic development and ethnicism

Against classical liberalism, which did not believe in "policy of positive discrimination" in favor of minorities and considered it to be a violation of private property rights and freedom, radical theorists, while considering capitalism as the main cause of racial and ethnic conflicts, considered capitalism as The unity element of various groups supports and considers the principle of "profit making" in this system as a factor in reducing ethnic and racial tensions. Because in their opinion, these hostilities are an obstacle to the free flow of capital and capital accumulation and must be removed in the capitalist system [4].

They believe that capitalism, despite its efforts to integrate minorities to increase the accumulation of capital and its free flow, unfortunately discriminates against ethnic groups and by "assigning low and secondary positions" and turning them into reserve and standby unemployed, they are deprived of this role. They use it to break labor strikes and get privileges and oppress other workers, and they marginalize the minority workers and with this act, "prevent them from obtaining political power" [4]. Looking at the works of thinkers, it can be seen that there is no doubt about the serious consequences of ethnic conflicts for economic development. Lebanon, Sri Lanka, Liberia, Guyana and Ethiopia are extreme cases (not to mention the Soviet Union and Yugoslavia). However, the temporal relationship between ethnic revival and different patterns of development is currently not easily discernible and ethnicity has been the neglected dimension in development theory [10].

The most basic type of conflicts in the path of economic development is related to the inherent unevenness of development at the national and global level, which means that certain regions are placed in more advantageous positions than other regions, and as a result, they acquire more investment and skills. Such centers usually become bases for nation-building, while people in remote or marginalized areas are reluctant citizens. Their protests are often expressed in ethnic terms, as this is usually the only way of social organization known to them. The government also usually creates common interests with the most commercial areas and becomes more dependent on these areas than elsewhere. In addition, the "state class" or high positions are often occupied by the same ethnic group, fueling ethnic animosities. Nevertheless, ethnic solidarity and regional particularism are also increasing in relatively advanced regions, which can be a very important obstacle in achieving development goals [10].

Nairn believes that this phenomenon is not only the inevitable result of industrialization, but also the result of unbalanced development after the 18th century. Contrary to expectations, industrial capitalist development between the center and the periphery did not happen in a balanced way and on the contrary, it caused the phenomenon of new and aggressive colonialism. This issue caused a reaction from the fringes and it appeared in the form of inevitability

in the name of nationalism until the social-historical cost of the cancerous expansion and spread of capitalism to the world ended up in nationalism [15].

In the theory called modernization, the ethnic identity belongs to the traditional barriers to development that were supposed to disappear in the end during the development process. Therefore, any kind of ethnic identity is considered an anti-development element and phenomenon. However, the orthodox liberals, such as John Toye, considered ethnicism a kind of “counter-revolution” in the path of economic development. Although the old modernization theory provides a macro and comprehensive view of the function of ethnicity in society, it does not focus on the phenomenon of ethnic conflict, because according to modernization thinkers, ethnicity is more or less considered as a pre-modern phenomenon [10].

Hechter, who has extensively discussed minorities in territorial borders, believed that the industrialization of the “center” of a country does not end with its comprehensive and national development, and that the center, this time in the territorial borders of a country, is the “margin”. It often exploits the “non-insider” and creates an unbalanced modernization. This type of unbalanced distribution causes the emergence of the advanced and privileged group in the center and the deprived and undeveloped group in the periphery, so that even in reaching the high and outstanding roles of economic, social and cultural development, there will be a kind of discrimination [9].

2.4 Research background

There is a lot of research on ethnicity. But the economic issue of ethnicity is rarely seen in foreign research and it can be said that it has been completely neglected in Iran as well. In the review of foreign articles, more than the ethnic and linguistic structures, most of the racial and skin color issues have been taken into consideration. For example, in the eighth chapter of the book “Identity economics” under the title of minority race and poverty, the issue of blacks or African Americans and discrimination against them has been investigated, and according to the authors of the article, there are two theories in the discrimination caused by traditional economics. A theory called superiority discrimination, which says that the reluctance of white employers and workers to work with blacks, has caused lower wages and occupational differences between African Americans and whites, and another theory called the theory of statistical discrimination presented by Kenneth Arrow, which says that employers Because of the mindset they have about the lesser abilities of blacks, they unintentionally discriminate against them.

But in domestic articles, more specific and limited cases have been dealt with. For example, Fakuhi [5] in an article considers Iran to be a country with a mosaic of identities that these mosaics have shaped, and therefore, a solution should be sought to reconcile its different types of identity. According to the author, globalization is a government process, which on the one hand wants to make everyone similar to each other, to bring thoughts closer together, and on the other hand to make perceptions similar to each other. In dealing with globalization, which sees everything as an economic tool, the new localisms have tried to manifest themselves as much as possible, and sometimes they have turned to open conflicts. “The role of ethnocentrism in the security of border areas, a case study: panterism in the border areas of East Azarbaijan and Ardabil provinces” is the title of another study conducted by Asadi Fard et al [2]. The researchers have concluded in this study that the people of Azerbaijan, Iran, while respecting their values and ethnic identity and being interested in a broader relationship with their relatives on the other side of the border, consider religious and national identity as social capital. They also consider themselves a member of the great country of Iran, and as a result, pan-terkist measures have no effect on the divergence of the residents of this region. Qadri [16] investigated the relationship between national identity and ethnic identity among the youth of Tabriz and by adopting a micro-approach in response to the reasons for seeking ethnic identity among the youth of Tabriz, the effect of parameters such as gender, marriage, education level, It has examined the employment status, type of job and income on this ethnic identity. Farhadi, Kazemi [6], in a study, the relationship between socio-economic development, ethnicity, and political participation among Kurds, Turks, and Baloch peoples has been examined. The results of this study show that economic development among Turks and Kurds is related to participation; But influenced by cultural factors, it takes on different meanings. Therefore, the participation of ethnic groups should be interpreted and understood with the ethnic contexts included in it. Also, the results showed that there is no correlation between participation and the factor of economic development among the Baloch people, but the pattern of action of this people is more influenced by cultural (religious) indicators. Based on the conclusion of the research, more attention should be paid to the importance of culture in the analysis of Iran’s ethnic issues. In another study, Karimi et al. [13] investigated the management of ethnic issues in the Islamic Republic of Iran and its effect on reducing ethnic conflicts and promoting national cohesion, and at the end suggested that in order to manage ethnic and religious diversity in Iran, models should be used. different policies of attention and among them, he chose the best model which is the “policy of pluralism of religious unification” and “the model of unity in plurality” and implemented it.

3 Research methodology

3.1 Research method and data collection tools

The present study is a cross-sectional survey in terms of practical purpose and in terms of location. In terms of controlling the research conditions, this research is a survey (descriptive-analytical) study, and in terms of the data collection method, it will be considered a correlational descriptive research. The data of this study has been collected in two ways, documentary and survey. In the documentary method, by referring to documents, libraries, and internet sites, the necessary materials and statistics have been collected by scanning. In the survey method, using the researcher-made questionnaire tool, the required data were collected with face-to-face and electronic questionnaires with a five-point Likert scale.

3.2 Society and statistical sample

The target statistical population in the research is the Turkish speaking students of Mohaghegh Ardabili University. The size of the statistical population is 1210 people. A sample size of 292 people with a confidence level of 95 % and a probability of error of 5% was obtained from the target population by simple random sampling method and using Cochran's sampling formula, 160 men and 132 women selected. Q and P values were considered 0.5 in this research.

$$n = \frac{\frac{t^2 pq}{d^2}}{1 + \frac{1}{N} \left(\frac{t^2 pq}{d^2} - 1 \right)}$$

$$N = 700, \quad t = 1.96, \quad p = 0.5, \quad q = 0.5, \quad d = 0.05$$

3.3 Reliability and validity of the questionnaire

Face validity was used to ensure validity or validity of the questionnaire. For this purpose, the initial questionnaire was designed and put in the hands of several professors and doctoral students of sociology, and the face validity of the questions was confirmed. To calculate the reliability, the reliability coefficient was calculated by calculating the Cronbach's alpha statistic with SPSS version 18 statistical software. The results of the calculation of this coefficient showed that its value was respectively for the variables of ethnicity (0.91), improvement of the economic index (0.89), economic conditions of Turkish-speaking countries (0.87), economic link between Azeri-inhabited areas (0.94) and the feeling of economic discrimination (0.88), which confirmed the appropriateness of the questions for analysis.

3.4 Descriptive statistics and statistical tests

In the following, after calculating the descriptive statistics of the collected variables such as mean, average and probability, inferential statistics will also be used to check the considered statistical assumptions. Therefore, at first, to measure the dependence or relationship between the desired variables, Pearson's correlation coefficient will be calculated.

Pearson's correlation coefficient is the covariance of the two variables divided by the product of their standard deviations. The form of the definition involves a "product moment", that is, the mean (the first moment about the origin) of the product of the mean-adjusted random variables; hence the modifier product-moment in the name.

Pearson's correlation coefficient, when applied to a sample, is commonly represented by r_{xy} and may be referred to as the sample correlation coefficient or the sample Pearson correlation coefficient. We can obtain a formula for r_{xy} by substituting estimates of the covariances and variances based on a sample into the formula above. Given paired data $[(x_1, y_1), \dots, (x_n, y_n)]$ consisting of n pairs, r_{xy} is defined as:

$$r = \frac{n \sum xy - (\sum x)(\sum y)}{\sqrt{[n \sum x^2 - (\sum x)^2][n \sum y^2 - (\sum y)^2]}}$$

where:

- r_{xy} = strength of the correlation between variables x and y
- n = sample size
- Σ = sum of what follows ...

- X = every x -variable value
- Y = every y -variable value
- XY = the product of each x -variable score and the corresponding y -variable score

If there is a relationship between the variables, we can express it with mathematical patterns. Usually, such a pattern may be linear or non-linear. If we can write the correlation pattern in the form of a linear equation, we will call it a linear regression equation, which will be used in this research to check the hypotheses of the research. A random sample and some statistical methods predict the behavior of the dependent variable with the knowledge of the values and characteristics of the independent variables. The purpose of correlation models is to examine the degree of relationship between two or more variables, while regression seeks to predict one or more variables based on one or more other variables. Therefore, the correlation coefficient shows the degree and intensity of the relationship between the variables, but the regression provides an equation to predict the variables.

A linear regression line has an equation of the form $y = \alpha + \beta x$ where \mathbf{X} is the explanatory variable and \mathbf{Y} is the dependent variable. The slope of the line is \mathbf{b} , and \mathbf{a} is the intercept (the value of \mathbf{y} when $\mathbf{x} = 0$).

which describes a line with slope β and y -intercept α . In general such a relationship may not hold exactly for the largely unobserved population of values of the independent and dependent variables; we call the unobserved deviations from the above equation the errors. Suppose we observe n data pairs and call them $\{(x_i, y_i), i = 1, \dots, n\}$. We can describe the underlying relationship between y_i and x_i involving this error term ε_i by:

$$y_i = \alpha + \beta x_i + \varepsilon_i.$$

This relationship between the true (but unobserved) underlying parameters α and β and the data points is called a linear regression model.

The goal is to find estimated values $\hat{\alpha}$ and $\hat{\beta}$ for α the β parameters α and β which would provide the “best” fit in some sense for the data points. As mentioned in the introduction, in this article the “best” fit will be understood as in the least-squares approach: a line that minimizes the sum of squared residuals (see also Errors and residuals) $\hat{\varepsilon}_i$ (differences between actual and predicted values of the dependent variable y), each of which is given by, for any candidate parameter values α and β .

$$\hat{\varepsilon}_i = y_i - \alpha - \beta x_i.$$

In other words, $\hat{\alpha}$ and $\hat{\beta}$ solve the following minimization problem:

$$\text{Find } \min_{\alpha, \beta} Q(\alpha, \beta), \text{ for } Q(\alpha, \beta) = \sum_{i=1}^n \hat{\varepsilon}_i^2 = \sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \alpha - \beta x_i)^2.$$

By expanding to get a quadratic expression in α and β , we can derive values of α and β that minimize the objective function Q (these minimizing values are denoted $\hat{\alpha}$ $\hat{\beta}$):

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\alpha} &= \bar{y} - (\hat{\beta} \bar{x}), \\ \hat{\beta} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x})(y_i - \bar{y})}{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x})^2} \\ &= \frac{S_{x,y}}{S_x^2} \\ &= r_{xy} \frac{S_y}{S_x}. \end{aligned}$$

3.5 Research assumptions

According to the purpose of this study and the questions raised in this research, hypotheses are proposed as follows, which will be tested according to their appropriate tests:

- 1) It seems that the improvement of national economic indicators has reduced political ethnicism in Iran’s Azerbaijan.
- 2) It seems that the improvement or decline of economic indicators in neighboring Turkic-speaking countries has a direct relationship with the intensification or reduction of political ethnicism in Iran’s Azerbaijan.
- 3) It seems that the improvement of interactions and economic links with the neighboring Turkic-speaking countries and other regions of Iran has had a significant impact with the intensification of political ethnicism in Iran’s Azerbaijan.

4 Research findings

4.1 Descriptive research findings

The results related to the description of the gender status of the sample are presented in Table 1. As can be seen in this table, 54.8% of the respondents are men and 45.2% of the respondents are women.

Table 1: Frequency distribution and frequency percentage of the gender of the statistical sample

Frequency Percent	frequency	gender
54.8	160	Man
45.2	132	Female
100	292	total

The results related to the description of the age status of the sample are presented in Table 2. According to the information in this table, it is clear that 50.3% of the respondents are people aged between 18 and 22 years, who have the highest amount. After this age group, 20.9% were between 23 to 27 years old, 16.4% were 28 to 32 years old, 6.8% were between 33 to 37 years old and finally 5.5% of people were between 38 to 42 years old.

Table 2: Frequency distribution and frequency percentage of the age of the statistical sample

Frequency Percent	Frequency	Age range
50.3	147	18-22 years
20.9	61	23-27 years
16.4	48	28-32 years
6.8	20	33-37 years old
5.5	16	38-42 years
100	292	total

The results related to the educational status of the sample are presented in Table 3. According to the information in this table, it is clear that in terms of education, 54.8% of people have bachelor's degree, 32.9% have master's degree, and 12.3% have doctorate.

Table 3: Education of the statistical sample

Frequency Percent	Frequency	degree of education
54.8	160	Bachelor's
32.9	96	Master's
12.3	36	Doctorate
100	292	total

4.2 Checking the normality of the variables

To test the research hypotheses, in order to know which of the parametric or non-parametric tests we should use, we must first check the normality of the distribution of the variables using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov (K-S) test. The null hypothesis and counter hypothesis of the K-S test will be as follows:

H_0 : The data distribution for the desired variable follows the normal distribution.

H_1 : The data distribution for the desired variable does not follow the normal distribution.

If the probability value is less than 0.05, the null hypothesis that the data is normal will be rejected. According to Table 4, since the probability value for all variables is greater than 0.05, therefore, the null hypothesis is accepted and with a confidence level of 95%, we can say that the distribution of all variables is normal. With the normalization of the statistical distribution of the mentioned variables, the use of parametric tests in the next steps will be unimpeded.

4.3 Test of research hypotheses

4.3.1 Test of the first hypothesis

According to the first hypothesis, it is stated that:

It seems that the improvement of national economic indicators has reduced the political ethnicism in Iran's Azerbaijan.

Table 4: The results of the Kolmogorov Smirnov (k-s) test for the main research variables

Result	P value	standard deviation	Average	Number	Variables
Accept the null hypothesis	0.87	1.28	3.8	292	Ethnicism
Accept the null hypothesis	0.73	1.09	3.7	292	Improving the national economic index
Accept the null hypothesis	0.69	1.03	4	292	Economic conditions of neighboring Turkish-speaking countries
Accept the null hypothesis	0.75	1.04	3.5	292	Economic link between Azeri regions

Due to the fact that in this section, we aim to investigate the relationship between the independent variable of economic indicators and the dependent variable of political ethnicity, so we use Pearson’s correlation coefficient for this case. Therefore, according to this hypothesis, we will have:

There is no significant relationship between the improvement of national economic indicators and the level of ethnicism in Azerbaijan.

There is a significant relationship between the improvement of national economic indicators and the level of ethnicism in Azerbaijan.

As can be seen in Table 5 there is a significant and positive relationship between the variable of improving economic indicators and ethnicity. According to the results of the Pearson test, which was done within the 95% confidence interval, the significant and direct relationship between the improvement of the economic index and the ethnicity is confirmed. Pearson’s correlation is equal to 0.86, which shows a positive and high relationship between these two variables, and therefore, according to these results, the first hypothesis is rejected and the improvement of economic indicators did not reduce political ethnicism in Azerbaijan, but with improvement National economic index and internal economic factors, the level of ethnicity increases.

Table 5: Results of Pearson’s correlation coefficient (first hypothesis test)

Result	P value	valuer	Test
Reject the null hypothesis	0.000	0.86	Pearson

4.3.2 Second hypothesis test

According to the second hypothesis, it is stated that:

It seems that the improvement of economic indicators in neighboring Turkic-speaking countries has a direct relationship with the intensification of political ethnicism in Iran’s Azerbaijan.

Therefore, we will put forward such a hypothesis as follows and test it in two ways:

The economic conditions of neighboring Turkic-speaking countries do not have a significant effect on ethnicism in Azerbaijan.

The economic conditions of neighboring Turkic-speaking countries have a significant impact on ethnicism in Azerbaijan.

As can be seen in Table 6 The variable of economic conditions of Turkish-speaking countries has a statistically significant relationship with ethnicity. According to the results of the Pearson test, this test shows a significant and positive relationship between the two mentioned variables in the 95% confidence interval, and the coefficient value is equal to $R = 0.89$, which shows the direct and very high correlation between the variables. shows Therefore, it can be said that the second hypothesis has been confirmed, and therefore, with the improvement of economic conditions in neighboring Turkic-speaking countries, political ethnicism increases in Azerbaijan, Iran.

Next, in order to predict changes in the dependent variable of ethnicity from the independent variable of the economic conditions of Turkish-speaking countries, a linear regression model was implemented to fit the existing data. Table 7 shows the significance of this regression model. Since $F = (290, 1)1115.43$ and the significance level of the model is less than 0.05, the significance of the entire fitted regression model is confirmed.

Table 6: Results of Pearson's correlation coefficient (second hypothesis test)

Result	<i>P value</i>	value	Test
Reject the null hypothesis	0.000	0.89	Pearson

Table 7: The results of variance analysis of the regression model of the second hypothesis

	sum of squares	mean square	Degrees of freedom	F	sig
regression	3249.285	3249.285	1	1115.430	0.000
residual	844.780	2.913	290		
Total	4094/065		291		

Now, according to Table 7, the coefficients of the variables in the regression model for the fixed value as well as the independent variable (economic conditions of Turkish-speaking countries) are shown in Table 8. As can be seen in this table, the coefficient value of the independent variable of the economic conditions of Turkish-speaking countries is equal to 0.79 and its significance level is less than 5%, which shows the positive and significant effect of this variable on the dependent variable of ethnicity. The value of the explanation coefficient of the model is also equal to 0.26, which shows that it is a relatively acceptable number. This numerical coefficient represents the percentage of political ethnocentrism variables that is explained by the independent variable.

Table 8: The results of the regression model of the second hypothesis

<i>R</i>	sig	Beta	standard deviation	<i>B</i>	independent variable
		-	0.804	6.705	Constant
0.26	0.000	0.891	0.024	0.790	Economic conditions of Turkic speaking countries

Therefore, we can show the regression model obtained for the second hypothesis as follows:

$$Y = 6.705 + 0.790X.$$

4.3.3 Test of the third hypothesis

According to the third hypothesis, it is stated that:

It seems that the improvement of interactions and economic ties with the neighboring Turkic-speaking countries and other regions of Iran has had a significant impact with the intensification of political ethnicism in Iran's Azerbaijan.

According to the above assumption, the following propositions will be tested:

More economic ties between Azeri-inhabited regions with other Turkic-speaking countries and other regions of Iran do not have a significant effect on the level of ethnocentrism.

More economic links between Azeri-inhabited regions with other Turkic-speaking countries and other regions of Iran have a significant impact on the level of ethnocentrism.

As can be seen in Table 9, there is a significant and inverse relationship between the variable of economic connection in Azeri-inhabited regions with other Turkic-speaking countries and other regions of Iran on ethnicity in Azerbaijan. According to the results of the Pearson test, which was measured in the 95% confidence interval, the Pearson correlation value is $R = -0.76$, which shows the negative relationship between the two variables. Therefore, it can be said that the third hypothesis is confirmed and the more the economic ties between the Azeri-inhabited regions with other Turkic-speaking countries and Iranian regions increase, the political ethnicism in these regions will decrease (and vice versa).

Table 9: Results of Pearson's correlation coefficient (third hypothesis test)

Result	<i>P value</i>	value	Test
Reject the null hypothesis	0.000	-0.76	Pearson

In order to predict the changes of the dependent variable of ethnicity from the independent variable of the economic link of Turkish speaking countries, a linear regression model was implemented to fit the available data. Table 10 shows

the significance of this regression model. Since $F = (290, 1) = 3682.08$ and the significance level of the model is less than 0.05, the significance of the entire fitted regression model is confirmed.

Table 10: The results of variance analysis of the regression model of the third hypothesis

sig	F	Degrees of freedom	mean square	sum of squares	
0.000	3682.086	1	3795.159	3795.159	regression
		290	1.031	298.906	residual
		291		4094/065	Total

The coefficients of the variables in the regression model for the fixed value as well as the independent variable (economic link of Turkish speaking countries) are shown in Table 11 As can be seen in this table, the value of the coefficient of the independent variable of the economic link of Turkish-speaking countries is equal to 0.959 and its significance level is less than 5%, which shows the negative and significant effect of this variable on the dependent variable of ethnicity. The value of the explanation coefficient of the model is also equal to 0.29, which shows that it is a relatively acceptable number. This numerical coefficient shows that 29% of the variation of political ethnicity is explained by the independent variable and the rest of the variation is due to other factors that are not included in this model.

Table 11: The results of the regression model of the third hypothesis

R	sig	Beta	standard deviation	B	independent variable
		-	0.534	1.169	Constant
0.29	0.000	0.963	0.016	-0.959	Economic conditions of Turkic speaking countries

Therefore, we can show the regression model obtained for the third hypothesis as follows:

$$Y = 0.959 - 1.169X$$

Discussion and conclusion

In the research that was done in the past in relation to the phenomenon of ethnicity and in other words ethnicism (as a political phenomenon) in Azerbaijan, the roots or the economic reasons of this issue were neglected and the upcoming research tried to take advantage of the political economy approach to both dimensions address the economic issue and find solutions to solve the upcoming challenges in this field. Therefore, in the upcoming research, an attempt was made to answer this basic question by using the analytical-descriptive approach and using the data that was prepared either through the documentary method or through the survey method, that “how the factors of political ethnicity, political ethnicity in Has Azerbaijan influenced Iran from 1978 to 2020?”

The results of this study showed that out of the three hypotheses considered in this study, all hypotheses are accepted. According to the first hypothesis that was stated: it seems that the improvement of national economic indicators has caused the reduction of political ethnicism in Azerbaijan, Iran, the results of the calculation of the correlation coefficient showed that there is a positive relationship between the two variables. Therefore, although the questioned people increasingly accept the role of economic issues in ethnicism and believe that it affects their minds, but more than this feeling, it has a root in reality, that is, there are real reasons for its occurrence and creating a sense of distinction among Their connection with other Iranians is rooted in their mentality. Because it is expected that ethnicism from its economic point of view is a feeling caused by the feeling of not sharing the same destiny with other members of a society. Therefore, it seems that we should look for external factors to answer why this feeling is measured in the next hypotheses.

In the second hypothesis, which was also confirmed, it was found that with the improvement of the economic conditions in the neighboring Turkic-speaking countries, the political ethnicism in Iran’s Azerbaijan also increases. Therefore, since the economic situation of neighboring Turkic-speaking countries has had a significant relative improvement during the last two decades. But witnessing our country falling into the swamp of economic non-growth (gross domestic product) which has subsequently caused a decrease in per capita income and an increase in absolute poverty, it is natural that seeing this backwardness has intensified the “feeling of being behind the train of progress” in the discussed statistical sample. This feeling, along with the “feeling of discrimination against oneself” that existed in the studied statistical sample, has led to the intensification of ethnic divergence among our target sample. Therefore,

we can confirm the validity of this hypothesis and confirm that there is a close relationship between the economic situation of the neighboring Turkic-speaking countries and the ethnicism in Azerbaijan, Iran. In the why of this matter, one should go to psychological analysis. In the book “Ethnic Movements and Psychological Operations”, Ali Kalirad has examined the wide dimensions of the influence of psychological agents as a tool in the hands of the Soviets and members of the democratic sect. While presenting various definitions of psychological operations, he considers the role of factors such as impact, access, execution method, effective psychological factors, convergence and strategic simultaneity in this phenomenon to be very effective. In the historical background section of the book, he considers psychological operations, rumor-mongering, creating fear and exploiting and inciting religious, racial, linguistic and ethnic differences as methods with precedent in this type of war. Finally, Kalirad defines psychological operations as a coherent and rhythmic action with political, military and sometimes economic goals, to have a desired effect on the minds of the target population [12].

It is obvious from what has been said that the feeling of ethnic divergence will increase with economic backwardness. The feeling of lagging behind the path of development will be able to harm the body of Iran. During the last two decades, especially from 2012 to 2020 and with the published statistics, the meaning of the economy can be shown by bringing up the situation of Iran. The statistics show that unlike the economic situation of the two neighboring states, Turkey and Azerbaijan, the priority in Iran has been other issues than the economic issue, and the results of this issue are evident in the resulting divergence.

In the third hypothesis, which was stated that “the more the economic links between the Azeri-inhabited regions and other regions of Iran, the political ethnicism in these regions will decrease”, the results showed its correctness and it was determined that there is an inverse relationship between the increase in interactions and economic links and the intensification of ethnicity. There is political orientation. Therefore, it can be said that according to the social position and roles of Azeris in Iran and according to the culture, class form and values and the texture of the market and cities of this region and according to the existing ideas about the concept of national identity in Iran from centuries ago until today under “Unity in Plurality” we can refer to how Azeris are placed next to other Iranian ethnic groups and confirm that Azeris have been integrated into Iranian national culture to a large extent. Therefore, increasing the commercial exchanges of Azeris with other Turkic speaking countries as well as other Iranian ethnic groups, in addition to allocating important positions to Azeri elites in political decision-making, can cause the subsidence of their ethnic feelings and naturally as an element that strengthens the phenomenon of national identity. It should be given more attention and ways to strengthen it should be adopted.

It is natural that neglecting the element of national identity among Iranian ethnic groups, along with the economic backwardness caused by the lack of priority of national interests in decision-making, has caused the national sentiments among the people of the Azerbaijan region to fade to some extent and has also created a feeling of backwardness in them compared to their cross-border speakers. Therefore, solutions such as increasing attention to the issue of ethnicities in the country’s economic, cultural and social development programs, continuous modification and updating of the dominant discourse in the country in order to adapt to the new needs and conditions, and prioritizing the issue of Iran as a historical connecting element in policy-making will be a way forward.

References

- [1] H. Ahmadi, *Ethnicity and Ethnicism in Iran*, Ney’s Publisher, Tehran, 1999.
- [2] M. Asadi Fard, Kh. Ghasemnejad, and F. Darvishi, *The role of ethnocentrism in the security of border areas (case study: pan-Turkism in the border areas of East Azerbaijan and Ardabil province)*, J. Border Stud. **3** (2014), 137-161.
- [3] A. Benningsen, *Pan-Turkism and Pan-Islamism in history and today*, Central Asian Survey **3** (1984), 39–49.
- [4] B. Clark, *Political Economy: A Comparative Approach*, Bloomsbury Publishing USA, 2016.
- [5] N. Fakuhi, *National culture, ethnic-group cultures and industrial economy market*, Iran. J. Socio. **7** (2005), no. 1, 121–148.
- [6] M. Farhadi and A. Kazemi, *Social economic development, ethnicity and political participation*, Soc. Stud. Res. Iran **4** (2012), 571–597.
- [7] A. Giddens and S. Griffiths, *Sociology*, Polity, 2006.
- [8] A. Haywood, *World Politics*, translated by Abdur Rahman Alam, Tehran, Qoms, 2016.

-
- [9] M.M. Hechter, *Internal colonialism: The Celtic fringe in British national development*, University of California Press, 1977.
- [10] B. Hettne, *Ethnicity and development an elusive relationship*, *Contemp. South Asia* **2** (1993), no. 2, 123–149.
- [11] R. Inayatullah, *Pan-Turkism*, *In the great Islamic Encyclopedia*, edited by Kazem Bojunordi, The center of the great Islamic encyclopedia, Tehran, 2004.
- [12] A. Kalirad, *Ethnic Movements and Psychological Operations: A Case Study of the Democratic Sect of Azerbaijan*, Andisheh Nagaristan Publications, Tehran, 2017.
- [13] Kh. Karimi, M. Abtahi, and M. Melabi, *Management of ethnic issues in the Islamic Republic of Iran and its effect on reducing ethnic conflicts and promoting national cohesion*, *Iran. Politic. Socio. Month.* **3** (2020), no. 4, 2287–2270.
- [14] W. Kymlicka, *Multicultural Citizenship: A liberal Theory of Minority Rights*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995.
- [15] T. Narin, *The Break-up of Britain: Crisis and Newnationalism*, Verso, 2nd ed, London, 1981.
- [16] S. Qadri, *Investigating the relationship between national identity and ethnic identity among the youth of Tabriz*, Master thesis, Tarbiat Modares University, 2002.
- [17] M. Rahmazadeh Haravi, *Race, Nation and Nation in Iran*, Ame Book, Tehran, 2014.
- [18] A. Sai, *Development in Conflicting Schools*, Qoms Publications, Tehran, 2015.
- [19] P.Q. Yang, *Ethnic Studies: Issues and Approaches*, State University of New York Press, New York, 2000.